

Research On the oft
Quoted Weak Hadeeth
of A'aishah Siddeequa
(Radhiallaahu Anha)

Compiled by
Abu Hibbaan & Abu Khuzaimah Ansaari

© Maktabah Ashaabul-Hadeeth 2003

Introduction

This is another hadeeth utilized by the people of shirk for grave worship and seeking help from other than Allaah. They use this hadeeth to (falsely) establish the permissibility of seeking help from the Messenger of Allaah (Sallallahu Alayhee Was-Sallam).

The Chain

Narrated **Abu Nu'maan** who heard from **Sa'eed bin Zaid** who heard from **Amr bin Maalik an-Nukree** and it was narrated to him from **Abul-Jawzaa Aws bin Abdullaah** who said

The Narration

“The people of Madeenah suffered a very severe drought, so they complained to A'aishah, so she said, “See the grave of the Prophet (Sallallahu Alayhee Was-Sallam) and make an opening in the roof above it, so that there is nothing between it and the sky.”....”

The Reference

Sunan Daarimee (1/34 no.92), Shaikh al-Albaanee has mentioned (1/43) in his monumental book at-Tawassul Anwaauhu Wa Ahkaamuhu (pg.126)

The Investigation

The First Narrator

Muhammad bin Fadhal Abu Nu'maan Basree.

Trustworthy but became forget when his memory deteriorated

Muhaddith al-Albaanee said,

“He was trustworthy but then his memory deteriorated at the end of his life. Al-Haafidh Burhaan ud deen al-Halabee mentions him amongst those who deteriorated in later life in his book ‘al-Muqaddimah’ (pg.391) and he says, “The ruling concerning these people is their narrations are accepted if reported from them before they started to forget, but the hadeeth narrated from them after they started to forget are not accepted or those there are problems with (ie not knowing if a narrator narrated from them before or after

they started to forget.) then these narrations are to be rejected.

I say: We do not know if this report was heard by Daarimee from him before or after his memory deteriorated, so it is therefore not acceptable, and cannot be used as evidence.” (Shaikh al-Ghumaree missed this defect in misbaah (pg.43) just as it was ignored by another (person) in order to give the impression to the people that this report is authentic.) (See at-Tawassul Anwaauhu Wa Ahkaamuhu (pg.127)

Haafidh Ibn Hajr said,

“Thiqatun-Thabt (the Affirmed Trustworthy), but he became forgetful at the end.” (Taqreeb ut-Tahdheeb (no.6266 pg.889)

Ibn Akyaal also mentioned the same in al-Kawaakib an-Neeraat Fee Ma'arifah Min Ikhtilaat Min Rawaah ath-Thiqaat (pg.52).

Others who said he was highly trustworthy and he started to forget at the end were from the likes of Imaam Bukhaari, Imaam Abu Dawood, Imaam Nasaa'ee, Imaam Daarqutnee, Imaams Abu Haatim and Ibn Abee Haatim, Imaam Ibn Hibbaan, Khateeb Baghdaadee and others. (see Tahdheeb ut-Tahdheeb (9/347-349 no.6516) of Haafidh Ibn Hajr, Meezaan ul-Ei'tidaal (6/298-299 no.8063) of Imaam Dhahabee, al-Jarh Wa-Ta'deel (8/58-59 no.267) of Imaam Ibn Abee Haatim, Taareekh al-Kabeer (1/208 no.654) of Imaam Bukhaari.

The Second Narrator Sa'eed bin Zaid.

Yahyaa bin Sa'eed said, "Weak." Sa'adee said, "He is not evidence and they say his ahadeeth are weak." Ahmad said, "No harm in him, Yahyaa bin Sa'eed would not accept him." Ibn al-Madeene said, "I heard Yahyaa bin Sa'eed say his hadeeth are very weak." al-A'ajuree on the authority of Abu Dawood who said, "Yahyaa bin Sa'eed said, "He is nothing." Juzjaanee said, "They say his hadeeth are weak and he is not evidence." Abu Bakr al-Bazaar and Daarqutnee said, "Weak." (Meezaan (3/203 no.3188), Tahdheeb ut-

Tahdheeb (4/29 no.2405), Kitaab adh-Dhu'afaa Wal-Matrookeen (1/319 no.1395) of Ibn al-Jawzee, at-Tawassul Anwaahu Wa Ahkaamuhu (pg.126).

Imaam Nasaa'ee and Abu Haatim said, "He is not strong." Abbaas Dooree said, "I heard Yahyaa ibn Ma'een say, "He is not strong." I said, "Are his hadeeth proof." He replied, "Write his ahadeeth." (Meezaan (3/203), Tahdheeb ut-Tahdheeb (4/29), al-Jarh Wat Ta'deel (4/21 no.87), Kitaab adh-Dhu'afaa Wal-Matrookeen (1/319), Khulaasah Tahdheeb al-Kamaal (1/379).

Imaam Ibn Hibbaan said,

"He was truthful and a preserver but he would make mistake in reports and he is not proof in the reports he is alone in reporting." (Kitaab al-Majrooheen Minal Muhadditheen (1/401-402 no.388)

Imaam Dhahabee said,

"He is not strong." (al-Kaashif (1/361). He is also weak according to al-Kaamil (3/1212)

Haafidh Ibn Hajr said in Taqreeb,

"Truthful but makes mistakes." (Taqreeb ut-Tahdheeb pg.378 no.2325)

Haafidh Ibn Hajr also brings statements from the Scholars of hadeeth saying he was also trustworthy (Tahdheeb ut-Tahdheeb (4/29 no.2405).

The Third Narrator

Amr bin Maalik an-Nukree

Concerning him Haafidh Ibn Hajr said,

"Truthful, but was forgetful." (Taqreeb ut-Tahdheeb (no.5139 pg.744)

The Fourth Narrator

Abul-Jawzaa Aws bin Abdullaah

Haafidh Ibn said,

“He would do a lot or Irsaal (ie omit narrators.), trustworthy.”
(Taqreeb ut-Tahdheeb (no. 582 pg.155)

Imaam Shaikh ul-Islam Ibn Taymiyyah said,

“As for the narration from A'aishah that mentions the making of the opening in the roof over the (prophets) grave so that it would rain, then this narration is not authentic nor is its chain established.” (Kitaab Radd Alal-Bakree (pg.68)

Compiled by the weak slaves of Allaah, in need of your supplications.
Abu Hibbaan & Abu Khuzaimah Ansaari
Maktabah Ashaabul-Hadeeth, Birmingham UK.

Completed 2003